

試 評

紅樓夢新英譯

六

林以亮

誤 譯

前文說過，天下沒有十全十美的翻譯，霍克斯的英譯石頭記自非例外。大體上看來，他的新譯非常出色，可以說是中譯英作品中的里程碑，值得借鏡的地方極多。然而在談到他具體的貢獻之前，應該先將少數錯失之處指出，正如在踏上平坦的道路之前，先要清除雜草一樣。

現在舉出幾個例子。第二回，冷子興和賈雨村談論賈氏家族的事，子興說如今榮寧二府也蕭索了，不比先時的光景。雨村問他怎麼一點看不出衰敗之象？子興回答了一長篇話，其中那幾句：

「古人有言：『百足之蟲，死而不僵』，如今雖說不似先年那樣興盛，較之平常仕宦人家，到底氣象不同。如今人口日多，事務日盛，主僕上下，都是安富尊榮，運籌謀畫的竟無一個。那日用排場，又不能將就省儉，如今外面的架子雖沒很倒，內囊却也盡上來了。」

霍克斯的譯文是：

‘Haven’t you ever heard the old saying, “The beast with a hundred legs is a long time dying”? Although I say they are not as prosperous as they used to be in years past, of

course I don't mean to say that there is not still a world of difference between *their* circumstances and those you would expect to find in the household of your average government official. At the moment the numbers of their establishment and the activities they engage in are, if anything, on the increase. Both masters and servants all lead lives of luxury and magnificence. And they still have plenty of plans and projects under way. But they can't bring themselves to economize or make any adjustment in their accustomed style of living. Consequently, though outwardly they still manage to keep up appearances, inwardly they are beginning to feel the pinch.'

(pp. 73-74)

譯文非常流暢，可惜他把「百足之蟲，死而不僵」譯為 'The beast with a hundred legs is a long time dying'。其實，「百足之蟲」就是中國人口語中的「百腳」。現在舉滕固的短篇小說：「百足蟲」一段為證。

「不好了，不好了！」說着把她的裙子亂撲，一條七八寸長的百足蟲落到地上，談甘忙的踏了一腳。她接着說：

「我最害怕是百足蟲，小時候幾次被牠咬傷皮膚。你看牠的身體踏做了二段，還會蠕蠕地不死呢。」

「這是所謂百足之蟲，死而不僵！」談甘揸了一句話，她由是狠命地去踏了幾腳。

林語堂當代漢英詞典中，「百足」譯為centipede。王際真把「百足之

蟲，死而不僵」譯成「The centipede dies but never falls down。」不知為什麼霍克斯會把這蟲譯為 the beast of a hundred legs—beast 通常指龐然巨物，有失原意。

接下去，「運籌謀畫的竟無一個」，指當時二府諸人耽於逸樂，只知坐吃山空，從不為將來打算，鳳姐當家，雖很精明，仍不過在移東補西；祇有日後探春、李紈、寶釵三人因鳳姐生病代為議事時，才想出一套日長歲久的計劃來。所以第二十二回脂評有這樣一段：

此探春遠適之讖也。使此人不遠去，將來事敗，諸子孫不致流散也，悲哉傷哉！

霍克斯却將「運籌謀畫的竟無一人」譯為And they still have plenty of plans and projects under way，等於說賈府還有很多計劃在進行中，與原意相反。

第六回，劉姥姥一進榮國府，溜到角門前。

只見幾個挺胸疊肚，指手畫腳的人坐在大門上，說東談西的。

譯文是：

A number of important-looking gentlemen sat in the gateway sunning their bellies and discoursing with animated gestures on a wide variety of topics. (p. 154)

「挺胸疊肚」是形容神氣活現的樣子，不一定說這些人把胸部和肚皮暴露出來曬太陽。

第十六回，賈璉從蘇州回來，進房與鳳姐相敘，問及家中諸事，又謝鳳姐的辛苦。鳳姐借機會大發牢騷，嫌家人難以應付，訴說她們卑劣的手段：

「坐山看虎鬪」，「借刀殺人」，「引風吹火」，「站乾岸兒」，「推倒了油瓶兒不扶」，都是全掛子的本事！

譯文是

Those old women know just how to sit on the mountain-top and watch the tigers fight; how to murder with a borrowed knife, or help the wind to fan the fire. They will look on safely from the bank while you are drowning in the river. And the fallen oil-bottle can drain away: *they* are not going to pick it up.

(p. 308)

這些都是成語，不應該完全照字面死譯。「坐山看虎鬪」就是照字面譯，顯得相當牽強。「借刀殺人」並非真的去借一把刀來謀殺人，而是指借別人的力量來陷害人。例如鳳姐利用秋桐逼使尤二姐吞金自盡，第六十九回的回目便是「弄小巧用借劍殺人」。更具體的說法見「官場現形記」第十七回的一段：

他二人從前在那裏又同過事，交情自與別人不同，所以特地進城拜望他，同他商酌一個借刀殺人的辦法。

「站乾岸兒」也不是指站在安全的岸上，眼看別人在河裏溺死。依照「小說詞語滙釋」的解釋，應作：「佔好地盤」解，換句話說，就是搶⁴佔據對自己有利的地盤。

第二十回，賈環與寶釵、香菱、鶯兒三人趕圍棋賭錢，輸了耍賴，鶯兒不肯，賈環急得直哭，寶釵勸他。

正值寶玉走來，見了這般景況，問：「是怎麼了？」賈環不敢則聲。寶釵素知他家規矩，凡做兄弟的怕哥哥。——却不知那寶玉是不要人怕他的。

霍克斯沒有看出「他家」僅指賈家，其餘人家未必都是如此。（例如在薛家，寶釵對薛蟠，寶琴對寶釵，這種現象就不明顯。）因此譯文走了

板。

Just at that moment Bao-yu walked in, and seeing the state that Jia Huan was in, asked him what was the matter. But Jia Huan dared not say anything.

Bao-chai, familiar with the state of affairs, normal in other families, which places the younger brother in fearful subjection to the elder, assumed that Jia Huan was afraid of Bao-yu. She was unaware that Bao-yu positively disliked anyone being afraid of him.

(p. 407)

「他家」譯為 other families，把其餘人家也包括在內，大有問題。賈家非常講究規矩，例如第二十三回，賈政決定讓寶玉與衆姊妹遷入大觀園中居住，派人叫寶玉來告訴他。寶玉聽說父親傳喚，以為又將挨罵，一步挪三寸的蹭了王夫人那邊。

寶玉挨身而入，只見賈政與王夫人對坐在炕上說話兒，地下一溜椅子，迎春、探春、惜春、賈環四人都坐在那裏。一見他進來，探春、惜春和賈環都站起來。

弟妹三人站起來，獨有迎春爲其姊，所以仍舊坐着不動，長幼之分，家規之嚴，於此可見。其他類似的例子不勝枚舉。

第二十三回，黛玉獨自走到梨香院牆角外，聽見十二個女孩子演唱戲文，唱的正是「牡丹亭」，其中有詞云：

又聽道：「你在幽閨自憐……」等句，越發如醉如痴，……又兼方纔所見西廂記中「花流水流紅，閒愁萬種」之句，都一時想起來，湊聚在一處。

這一段情景可以用「傷春」二字來描寫。霍克斯的譯文則是：

'I have sought you everywhere,
And at last I find you here,
In a dark room full of woe—'

It was like intoxication, a sort of delirium.....
From that her mind turned to.....some lines
from *The Western Chamber* which she had just
been reading:

As flowers fall and the flowing
stream runs red,
A thousand sickly fancies crowd
the mind.

(pp. 466-467)

「幽」可作幽靜、幽雅、幽遠、清幽解，但「幽閨」並非「暗室」。少女獨處幽閨是很普通的說法，並不一定指關閉在黑暗的房間裏。「閒愁萬種」也是少女因看見落花、讀西廂記、聽牡丹亭而引起的傷春之感。霍克斯譯為 *sickly fancies* 筆觸略嫌太重，王際真譯為 *idle, melancholy thoughts* 比較平實。

第二十四回，賈芸因想求鳳姐給他一份差使，從倪二處借到錢，買了些冰片和麝香孝敬鳳姐，但又不得不設詞解釋。

「我就和我母親商量，賤賣了可惜，要送人，也沒有人家兒配使這些香料。因想到孀娘往年間還拿大包的銀子買這些東西呢，別說今年貴妃宮中，就是這個端陽節所用，也一定比往年要加十幾倍，所以拿來孝敬孀娘。」

譯文是：

'.....and I was discussing with Mother last night what we ought to do with it. We don't know anyone who could afford to buy it; and

it seems a shame to sell it at less than the price; and even if we *gave* it away, we couldn't think of anyone who would want so much. But then I suddenly thought of you and the packets of money you've spent on this kind of thing in years past, and I thought to myself that this year, what with Her Grace in the Palace and the Double Fifth already not far off, you're sure to be using ten or twelve times the usual amount. So, to cut a long story short, we decided to make a present of it to you. There you are, Auntie — a little token of my esteem!'

(p. 478)

譯文大致根據程高本，但 We don't know anyone who could afford to buy it 則是從鈔本系統中節譯出來的，可置不論；不過譯者把「沒有人家兒配使」譯為 we couldn't think of anyone who would want so much 與原意頗有出入，所謂「配使」是指鳳姐有這身份和氣派使用這些名貴香料，而不是指今年因貴妃省親和端陽特別需要，用量大為增加，才送給鳳姐的。

第二十六回，黛玉聽得寶玉回來了，想知道賈政找他究竟是怎麼回事。

（黛玉）剛到了沁芳橋，只見各色水禽盡都在池中浴水，也認不出名色來，但見一個個文彩紈灼，好看異常，因而站住，看了一回。

譯文應該沒有問題，不過還是出了岔子：

Continuing to amble on, she came presently to
Drenched Blossoms Bridge, from which a large

number of different kinds of fish were to be seen swimming about in the water below. Dai-yu did not know what kinds of fish they were, but they were so beautiful that she had to stop and admire them……

(pp. 523-524)

按「水禽」，根據國語辭典，「猶水鳥」，絕對不是魚。此處應指鴛鴦或其他浴水的珍異鳥類，不知譯者怎麼會走了眼？

還有些地方是譯者讀紅樓夢不夠熟，對原作的主旨沒有充份把握而引起的問題。例如同回有這樣一長段，描述寶玉去探視黛玉的情形。

……便順着脚一徑來至一個院門前，看那鳳尾森森，龍吟細細，正是瀟湘館。寶玉信步走入，只見湘簾垂地，悄無人聲。走至窗前，覺得一縷幽香，從碧紗窗中暗暗透出。

鳳尾森森

龍吟細細

是非常重要的關鍵字眼，因為根據脂評，我們知道迷失的曹雪芹遺稿中，黛玉死後的瀟湘館面目全非，

「與後文

落葉蕭蕭

寒煙漠漠

一對，可傷可嘆。」

所謂「鳳尾」是一種竹名，辭源中即有鳳尾竹，別稱「觀音竹，枝葉婆娑可愛。」國語辭典亦說鳳尾是「竹名，高五六尺，梢似鳳尾。」至於「龍吟」，辭源曰：「謂笛也。（張說桐竹詩）：竹有龍吟管。」辭海則稱它為狀聲之詞。坊間流行的一百二十回本紅樓夢就有這樣一條註解：

鳳尾森森，龍吟細細——古時有用龍鳳喻竹的。這兒鳳尾狀竹葉的形態，龍吟狀風吹竹葉的聲音。

可謂清楚明白。現在讓我們來看一下譯文：

Moving on, without much thinking where he was going, he came presently to the gate of a courtyard.

Denser than patters on the phoenix tail. The stirred leaves murmured with a pent dragon's moan. The multitudinous bamboos and the board above the gate confirmed that his feet had, without conscious direction, carried him to the Naiad's House. Of their own accord they now carried him through the gateway into the courtyard.

The House seemed silent and deserted, its bamboo doorblind hanging unrolled to the ground; but as he approached the window, he detected a faint sweetness in the air, traceable to a thin curl of incense smoke which drifted out through the green gauze of the casement.

(p. 516)

鳳尾和龍吟都照字面譯了出來。至於 a pent dragon's moan，等於一條被困的蛟龍的呻吟，未免過份。

可是這一段中還有更微妙的一點。「一縷幽香」的譯文添出了半句，如果譯回中文就變成：空中聞到一股幽香，來自點着的爐香。這與原作者的用意頗有出入。「一縷幽香」先見第五回寶玉夢中到太虛幻境，「但聞一縷幽香」，警幻仙姑告訴他「此香乃塵世所無，爾如何能知！此係諸名山勝境初生異卉之精，合各種寶林珠樹之油所製，名為『羣芳髓』」。譯者把它譯為 a faint, subtle scent。

然後第八回，寶玉來到寶釵處。

寶玉此時與寶釵挨肩坐着，只聞一陣陣的香氣，不知何味，遂問：「姐姐薰的是什麼香？我竟沒聞過這味兒。」寶釵道：「我最怕薰香，好好兒的衣裳，為什麼薰他？」寶玉道：「那麼着，這是什麼香呢？」寶釵想了想，說：「是了，是我早起吃了『冷香丸』的香氣。」

寶釵雖然推說這香氣來自「冷香丸」，其實是體香。黛玉與寶釵二人爲人世間少有的美女，故具此異稟。根據脂評，黛玉雖然爲正十二釵之冠，而讀者一向左釵而右黛，多半出自感情作用。作者的用意，照龔平伯的解說，「兩峯對峙雙水分流，各盡其妙莫能相下。」所以二人在正十二釵冊子中同處一畫，平分秋色。此點已由他在「紅樓夢研究」一書中闡釋得很清楚。在第十九回，就有這樣一段：

寶玉總沒聽見這些話，只聞見一股幽香，却是從黛玉袖中發出，聞之令人醉魂酥骨。寶玉一把便將黛玉的衣袖拉住，要瞧瞧籠着何物。黛玉笑道：「這時候誰帶什麼香呢？」寶玉笑道：「那麼着，這香是那裏來的？」黛玉道：「連我也不知道，想必是櫃子裏頭的香氣薰染的，也未可知。」寶玉搖頭道：「未必。這香的氣味奇怪，不是那些香餅子、香毬子、香袋兒的香。」

這是譯文：

But her words were lost on Bao-yu. He was preoccupied with a subtle fragrance which seemed to emanate from Dai-yu's sleeve—a fragrance that intoxicated the senses and caused one to feel rather limp. He seized hold of the sleeve and demanded to know what perfume she was wearing.

'Perfume? At this season?' said Dai-yu

with a laugh. 'I'm not wearing any. "In the cold winter none smells sweet"!'

'Well, where *does* it come from, then?'

'I don't know myself where it comes from,' said Dai-yu. 'I suppose it might have come from the wardrobe.'

Bao-yu shook his head.

'I doubt it. It's a very unusual scent. Not the kind you would get from a scent-cake or a perfume-ball or sachet.'

(p. 394)

'In the cold winter none smells sweet' 來自俞校本——黛玉笑道：「冬寒十冷，誰帶什麼香呢。」那麼這一股幽香究竟是什麼？我相信是黛玉身上的體香，與寶釵的體香同樣迷人。脂評在黛玉說：「連我也不知道」下有這樣一段：

止是。按諺云，「人在氣中忘氣，魚在水中忘水」。余今續之曰：「美人忘容，花則忘香。」此則黛玉不知自骨肉中之香同。

可以說是最好的解釋。於是我們禁不住要問：同樣的一縷幽香，為什麼從第十九回到了第二十六回就變了質呢？二者明明同指一事，而且來自同一根源；譯者却把第二次的「一縷幽香」解釋為點着的爐香，以普通的日用品代替作者心中的優美意境，未免煞風景。我在「紅與綠——一個基本問題」一文的前言中說過：「紅樓夢這本鉅著，讀起來並不容易，……讀這本書，我們非但要細心，更要虛心。」就是這個意思。

然而話說回來，即以今日一般中國讀者而論，他們讀紅樓夢，在成語方面或者不會有問題，其餘如俚語、典故、伏筆和前後呼應，未必能完全領會。現在校閱霍克斯五百二十五頁的譯文，所發現的疏忽、遺漏和誤譯也不過上述寥寥數處。他譯文中精采絕倫之處尚未細論，其瑕不掩瑜自不待言。（待續）